

objectivism. Here all that was necessary was for Wittgenstein to recognise the truth of conceptual pragmatism, seeing that there may be a number of distinct but similar concepts in a given area of discourse from amongst which we are to select the one which best subserves our purposes. For as we saw in Chapter 11, our commitment to Excluded Third can only reflect the fact that within assertoric discourse our interest in truth is primary. Yet we can easily imagine circumstances in which our interests would be different, such that we should select a way of drawing the true/false distinction which would leave room for a third possibility. Yet so far as I can see, conceptual pragmatism would be consistent with all of Wittgenstein's other doctrines, including logical objectivism. On this see my (1987b), where I argue that conceptual pragmatism is not only consistent with both logical objectivism and its denial, but also with Platonism. 13 For discussion of these issues see many of the chapters in Dummett (1978) as well as his (1982), and Wright (1980) as well as the chapters in his (1986b).

References

- Albritton, R. (1959). On Wittgenstein's Use of the Term 'Criterion'. *Journal of Philosophy* 56, 845–57.
- Allaire, Edwin (1959). Tractatus 6.3751. *Analysis* 19, 100–5.
- (1963). The Tractatus: Nominallistic or Realistic? in Copi & Beard (1966), 32.5–42.
- Ambrose, Alice, ed. (1979). *Wittgenstein's Lectures, Cambridge 1932–35* (Oxford: Basil Blackwell).
- Anscombe, G. E. M. (1959). *An Introduction to Wittgenstein's Tractatus* (London: Hutchinson).
- Anscombe, G. E. M. & P. T. Geach (1961). *Three Philosophers* (Oxford: Blackwell).
- Armstrong, D. M. (1978). *Universals and Scientific Realism* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press).
- (1983). *What is a Law of Nature?* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press).
- Ayer, A. J. (1936). *Language, Truth and Logic* (London: Gollancz).
- (1985). *Wittgenstein* (Harmondsworth: Penguin).
- Baker, G. P. (1981). Following Wittgenstein. In *Wittgenstein: To Follow a Rule*, ed. S. Holtzman and C. Leich (London: Routledge & Kegan Paul).
- Baker, G. P. & P. M. S. Hacker (1980). *Wittgenstein: Understanding and Meaning* (Oxford: Blackwell).
- (1984). *Frege: Logical Excavations* (Oxford: Blackwell).
- (1985). *Wittgenstein: Rules, Grammar and Necessity* (Oxford: Blackwell).
- Bell, David (1979). *Frege's Theory of Judgement* (Oxford: Oxford University Press).
- Benacerraf, Paul (1965). What Numbers Could Not Be. *Philosophical Review* 74, 47–73.
- (1973). Mathematical Truth. *Journal of Philosophy* 70, 661–80.
- Bennett, J. (1975). *Kant's Dialectic* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press).
- Black, Max (1964). *A Companion to Wittgenstein's Tractatus* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press).
- Blackburn, Simon (1984). *Spreading the Word* (Oxford: Oxford University Press).
- Blackwell, Kenneth (1981). The Early Wittgenstein and the Middle Russell. In Irving Block (1981), 1–30.

- Block, Irving, ed. (1981). *Perspectives on the Philosophy of Wittgenstein* (Oxford: Blackwell).
- Block, Ned, ed. (1981). *Readings in Philosophy of Psychology*, Vol. II (London: Methuen).
- Bogen, James (1972). *Wittgenstein's Philosophy of Language* (London: Routledge & Kegan Paul).
- Bolton, Derek (1979). *An Approach to Wittgenstein's Philosophy* (London: Macmillan).
- Bradley, Raymond (1987). Tractatus 2.022–2.023. *Canadian Journal of Philosophy* 17, 349–60.
- Burge, Tyler (1979). Sinning against Frege. *Philosophical Review* 88, 389–432.
- Butterfield, Jeremy, ed. (1986). *Language, Mind and Logic* (Cambridge, Cambridge University Press).
- Carruthers, Peter (1981). Frege's Regress. *Aristotelian Society Proceedings* 82, 17–32.
- (1984). Baker and Hacker's Wittgenstein. *Synthese* 58, 451–79.
- (1985). Ruling-out Realism. *Philosophia* 15, 61–78.
- (1986). *Introducing Persons: Theories and Arguments in the Philosophy of Mind* (London: Croom Helm; Albany: SUNY).
- (1987a). Russellian Thoughts. *Mind* 96, 18–35.
- (1987b). Conceptual Pragmatism. *Synthese* 73, 205–24.
- (1989a). Brute Experience. *Journal of Philosophy* 86, 258–69.
- (1989b). *Tractarian Semantics: Finding Sense in Wittgenstein's Tractatus* (Oxford: Blackwell).
- Coope, C., P. Geach, T. Potts & R. White (1971). *A Wittgenstein Workbook* (Oxford: Blackwell).
- Copi, Irving (1958a). Tractatus 5.542. *Analysis* 18, 102–4.
- (1958b). Objects, Properties and Relations in the Tractatus. *Mind* 67, 145–65.
- Copi, Irving & Robert Beard, eds. (1966). *Essays on Wittgenstein's Tractatus* (London: Routledge & Kegan Paul).
- Currie, Gregory (1982a). *Frege: An Introduction to his Philosophy* (Brighton: Harvester).
- (1982b). Frege, Sense and Mathematical Knowledge. *Australasian Journal of Philosophy* 60, 5–19.
- (1984). Frege's Metaphysical Argument. In Wright (1984b), 144–57.
- Davidson, Donald (1980). *Essays on Actions and Events* (Oxford: Oxford University Press).
- (1984). *Inquiries into Truth and Interpretation* (Oxford: Oxford University Press).
- Davidson, Donald & Gilbert Harman, eds. (1972). *The Semantics of Natural Language* (Dordrecht: Reidel).
- Diamond, Cora, ed. (1976). *Wittgenstein's Lectures on the Foundations of Mathematics* (Brighton: Harvester).
- Donnellan, Keith (1966). Reference and Definite Descriptions. *Philosophical Review* 75, 281–304.
- (1972). Proper Names and Identifying Descriptions. In Davidson & Harman (1972), 356–79.
- (1974). Speaking of Nothing. *Philosophical Review* 83, 3–31.
- Dummett, Michael (1973). *Frege: Philosophy of Language* (London: Duckworth).
- (1975). What is a Theory of Meaning? (I). In Guttenplan (1975), 97–138.
- (1976). What is a Theory of Meaning? (II). In Evans & McDowell (1976), 67–137.
- (1978). *Truth and Other Enigmas* (London: Duckworth).
- (1981a). Frege and Wittgenstein. In Irving Block (1981), 31–42.
- (1981b). *The Interpretation of Frege's Philosophy* (London: Duckworth).
- (1982). Realism. *Synthese* 52, 55–112.
- (1984). An Unsuccessful Dig. In Wright (1984b), 194–226.
- Engelmann, Paul (1967). *Letters from Ludwig Wittgenstein with a Memoir* (Oxford: Blackwell).
- Evans, Gareth (1973). The Causal Theory of Names. *Aristotelian Society Proceedings* supp. vol. 47, 187–208.
- (1982). *The Varieties of Reference* (Oxford: Oxford University Press).
- Evans, Gareth & John McDowell, eds. (1976). *Truth and Meaning* (Oxford: Oxford University Press).
- Favrholt, David (1964). *An Interpretation and Critique of Wittgenstein's Tractatus* (Copenhagen: Munksgaard).
- Finch, Henry (1971). *Wittgenstein: The Early Philosophy* (New Jersey: Humanities).
- Fodor, Jerry (1981). *Representations* (Brighton: Harvester).
- Fogelin, Robert (1976). *Wittgenstein* (London: Routledge & Kegan Paul).
- (1982). Wittgenstein's Operator N. *Analysis* 42, 124–7.
- Frege, Gottlob (1952). *Philosophical Writings*, trans. P. Geach and M. Black (Oxford: Blackwell).
- (1964). *The Basic Laws of Arithmetic*, trans. M. Furth (California: California University Press).
- (1968). *The Foundations of Arithmetic*, trans. J. Austin (Oxford: Blackwell).
- (1972). *Conceptual Notation and Related Articles*, trans. T. Bynum (Oxford: Oxford University Press).
- (1979). *Posthumous Writings*, trans. P. Long and R. White (Oxford: Blackwell).
- (1980). *Philosophical and Mathematical Correspondence*, trans. B. McGuinness & H. Kaal (Oxford: Blackwell).
- (1984). *Collected Papers*, trans. various (Oxford: Blackwell).
- Geach, Peter (1951). Frege's Grundlagen. *Philosophical Review* 60, 535–44.
- (1955). Class and Concept. *Philosophical Review* 64, 561–70.
- (1957). *Mental Acts* (London: Routledge & Kegan Paul).
- (1961). Frege. In Anscombe & Geach (1961), 127–62.
- (1962). *Reference and Generality* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press).
- (1974). Six Lectures on Wittgenstein's Tractatus. Unpublished typescript.
- (1981). Wittgenstein's Operator N. *Analysis* 41, 168–70.
- (1982). More on Wittgenstein's Operator N. *Analysis* 42, 127–8.

- Goddard, Leonard & Brenda Judge (1982). *The Metaphysics of Wittgenstein's Tractatus* (Australasian Journal of Philosophy Monograph).
- Goldstein, L. (1983). Scientific Scotism. *Australasian Journal of Philosophy* 61, 40–57.
- (1986). The Development of Wittgenstein's Views on Contradiction. *History & Philosophy of Logic* 7, 43–56.
- Grice, H. P. (1957). Meaning. *Philosophical Review* 66, 377–88.
- (1969). Utterer's Meaning and Intention. *Philosophical Review* 78, 147–77.
- Griffin, James (1964). *Wittgenstein's Logical Atomism* (Oxford: Oxford University Press).
- Guttenplan, Samuel, ed. (1975). *Mind and Language* (Oxford: Oxford University Press).
- Hacker, P. M. S. (1972). *Insight and Illusion* (Oxford: Oxford University Press).
- (1986). *Insight and Illusion*, revised edition (Oxford: Oxford University Press).
- Hintikka, Jaakko (1958). On Wittgenstein's 'Solipsism'. *Mind* 67, 88–91.
- Hintikka, Merrill & Jaakko Hintikka (1986). *Investigating Wittgenstein* (Oxford: Blackwell).
- Hughes, G. & M. Cresswell (1968). *An Introduction to Modal Logic* (London: Methuen).
- Ishiguro, Hidé (1969). Use and Reference of Names. In Winch (1969), 20–50.
- (1979). Subjects, Predicates, Isomorphic Representation and Language-Games. In *Essays in Honour of Jaakko Hintikka*, ed. E. Saarinen, R. Hilpinen, I. Niiniluoto and M. Hintikka (Dordrecht: Reidel), 351–64.
- (1981). Wittgenstein and the Theory of Types. In Irving Block (1981), 43–59.
- Kant, I. (1929). *Critique of Pure Reason*, trans. N. Kemp Smith (London: Macmillan).
- Katz, Jerrold (1981). *Language and Other Abstract Objects* (Oxford, Blackwell).
- Kenny, Anthony (1973). *Wittgenstein* (London: Penguin).
- (1974). The Ghost of the Tractatus. *Royal Institute of Philosophy Lectures*, Vol. VII (London: Macmillan), 1–13.
- (1981). Wittgenstein's Early Philosophy of Mind. In Irving Block (1981), 140–8.
- Keyt, David (1963). Wittgenstein's Notion of an Object. *Philosophical Quarterly* 13, 3–15.
- Klemke, E. D., ed. (1968). *Essays on Frege* (Chicago: Illinois University Press).
- Kripke, Saul (1979). A Puzzle about Belief. In Margalit (1979), 239–83.
- (1980). *Naming and Necessity* (Oxford: Blackwell).
- (1982). *Wittgenstein on Rules and Private Language* (Oxford: Blackwell).
- Lee, Desmond, ed. (1980). *Wittgenstein's Lectures, Cambridge 1930–32* (Oxford: Blackwell).
- Lewis, David (1983). *Philosophical Papers*, Vol. I (Oxford: Oxford University Press).
- Loar, Brian (1981). *Mind and Meaning* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press).
- Long, Peter (1969). Are Predicates and Relational Expressions Incomplete? *Philosophical Review* 78, 90–8.
- (1982). Formal Relations. *Philosophical Quarterly* 32, 151–61.
- McDonough, Richard (1986). *The Argument of the Tractatus* (Albany: SUNY).
- McDowell, John (1977). On the Sense and Reference of a Proper Name. *Mind* 86, 159–85.
- (1980). Meaning, Communication and Knowledge. In van Straaten (1980), 117–39.
- (1984). *De Re Senses*. In Wright (1984b), 98–109.
- (1986). Singular Thought and the Extent of Inner Space. In Pettit & McDowell (1986), 137–68.
- McGinn, Colin (1982a). The Structure of Content. In Woodfield (1982), 207–58.
- (1982b). *The Character of Mind* (Oxford: Oxford University Press).
- (1984). *Wittgenstein on Meaning* (Oxford: Blackwell).
- McGuinness, Brian (1974). The Grundgedenke of the Tractatus. *Royal Institute of Philosophy Lectures* Vol. VII (London: Macmillan), 49–61.
- (1981). The So-called Realism of Wittgenstein's Tractatus. In Irving Block (1981), 60–73.
- ed. (1982). *Wittgenstein and his Times* (Oxford: Blackwell).
- (1988). *Wittgenstein: A Life*, Vol. I (London: Duckworth).
- Mackie, J. L. (1976). The Riddle of Existence. *Aristotelian Society Proceedings* supp. vol. 50, 247–67.
- Malcolm, Norman (1958). *Wittgenstein: A Memoir* (Oxford: Oxford University Press).
- (1986). *Nothing is Hidden* (Oxford: Blackwell).
- Margalit, A., ed. (1979). *Meaning and Use* (Dordrecht: Reidel).
- Maslow, Alexander (1961). *A Study in Wittgenstein's Tractatus* (Los Angeles: California University Press).
- Morris, Thomas (1984). *Understanding Identity Statements* (Aberdeen: Aberdeen University Press).
- Mounce, H. O. (1981). *Wittgenstein's Tractatus: An Introduction* (Oxford: Blackwell).
- Nagel, Thomas (1986). *The View from Nowhere* (Oxford: Oxford University Press).
- Noonan, Harold (1979). Rigid Designation. *Analysis* 39, 174–82.
- (1980). Names and Belief. *Aristotelian Society Proceedings* 81, 93–108.
- (1984). Fregean Thoughts. *Philosophical Quarterly* 34, 205–25.
- (1986). Russellian Thoughts and Methodological Solipsism. In Butterfield (1986), 67–90.
- Ogden, C. K. & I. A. Richards (1923). *The Meaning of Meaning* (London: Routledge & Kegan Paul).
- Pears, David (1971). *Wittgenstein* (London: Fontana).
- (1981), 74–84.
- (1987). *The False Prison*, Vol. I (Oxford: Oxford University Press).
- (1988). *The False Prison*, Vol. II (Oxford: Oxford University Press).

- Perry, John (1977). Frege on Demonstratives. *Philosophical Review* 86, 474–97.
 (1979). The Problem of the Essential Indexical. *Nous* 13, 3–21.
 Pettit, Philip & John McDowell, eds. (1986). *Subject, Thought and Context* (Oxford: Oxford University Press).
- Putnam, Hilary (1973). *Mind, Language and Reality* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press).
- Quine, W. V. O. (1953). *From a Logical Point of View* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press).
- (1960). *Word and Object* (Cambridge, Mass.: MIT Press).
- Ramsey, F. P. (1923). Review of the *Tractatus*. *Mind* 32, 465–78.
 (1978). *Foundations* (London: Routledge & Kegan Paul).
- Russell, Bertrand (1903). *The Principles of Mathematics* (London: Allen & Unwin).
- (1910a). *Philosophical Essays* (London: Allen & Unwin).
- (1910b). With A. N. Whitehead, *Principia Mathematica* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press).
- (1912). *The Problems of Philosophy* (Oxford: Oxford University Press).
- (1914). *Our Knowledge of the External World* (London: Allen & Unwin).
- (1917). *Mysticism and Logic* (London: Allen & Unwin).
- (1921). *The Analysis of Mind* (London: Allen & Unwin).
- (1940). *An Inquiry into Meaning and Truth* (London: Allen & Unwin).
- (1956). *Logic and Knowledge*, ed. R. Marsh (London: Allen & Unwin).
- (1984). *The Collected Papers of Bertrand Russell*, Vol. VII, ed. E. Eames and K. Blackwell (London: Allen & Unwin).
- Sainsbury, Mark (1979). *Russell* (London: Routledge & Kegan Paul).
- Salmon, Nathan (1982). *Reference and Essence* (Oxford: Blackwell).
- (1986). *Frege's Puzzle* (Cambridge, Mass.: MIT Press).
- Searle, John (1957). Russell's Objections to Frege's Theory of Sense and Reference. *Analysis* 18, 137–43.
 (1958). Proper Names. *Mind* 67, 166–73.
 (1983). *Intentionality* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press).
- Sellars, W. (1962a). Naming and Saying. In Copl & Beard (1966), 249–69.
 (1962b). Truth and 'Correspondence'. *Journal of Philosophy* 59, 29–56.
- Shwayder, David (1963). On the Picture Theory of Language. *Mind*, 72, 275–88.
- Sluga, Hans (1980). *Gottlob Frege* (London: Routledge & Kegan Paul).
- Stalnaker, Robert (1976). Propositions. In *Issues in the Philosophy of Language*, ed. A. Mackay and D. Merrill (New Haven: Yale University Press), 79–91.
- Stenius, Erik (1960). *Wittgenstein's Tractatus* (Oxford: Blackwell).
- (1975). Wittgenstein and Ogden. *Philosophical Quarterly* 25, 62–8.
- Stock, Guy (1974). Wittgenstein on Russell's Theory of Judgement. *Royal Institute of Philosophy Lectures*, Vol. VII (London: Macmillan), 62–75.
- Straaten, Zak van, ed. (1980). *Philosophical Subjects* (Oxford: Oxford University Press).
- Strawson, P. F. (1959). *Individuals* (London: Methuen).
- (1971). *Logico-Linguistic Papers* (London: Methuen).
- Tugendhat, E. (1970). The Meaning of 'Bedeutung' in Frege. *Analysis* 30, 177–89.
- von Wright, G. H. (1982). *Wittgenstein* (Oxford: Blackwell).
- Waismann, F. (1965). *Principles of Linguistic Philosophy*, ed. R. Harré (London: Macmillan).
- (1979). *Wittgenstein and the Vienna Circle*, trans. J. Schulte and B. McGuinness (Oxford: Blackwell).
- White, R. M. (1973). Wittgenstein and the General Propositional Form. Unpublished manuscript.
- (1974). Can Whether one Proposition Makes Sense Depend on the Truth of Another? *Royal Institute of Philosophy Lectures*, Vol. VII (London: Macmillan), 14–29.
- (1978). Wittgenstein on Identity. *Aristotelian Society Proceedings* 78, 157–74.
- Winch, Peter, ed. (1969). *Studies in the Philosophy of Wittgenstein* (London: Routledge & Kegan Paul).
- Wittgenstein, Ludwig (1922). *Tractatus Logico-Philosophicus*, trans. C. Ogden (London: Routledge & Kegan Paul).
- (1929). Some Remarks on Logical Form. *Aristotelian Society Proceedings* supp. vol. 9, 162–71.
- (1953). *Philosophical Investigations*, trans. G. Anscombe (Oxford: Blackwell).
- (1961a). *Tractatus Logico-Philosophicus*, trans. D. Pears and B. McGuinness (London: Routledge & Kegan Paul).
- (1961b). *Notebooks 1914–18*, trans. G. Anscombe (Oxford: Blackwell).
- (1971). *Prototractatus*, trans. D. Pears and B. McGuinness (London: Routledge & Kegan Paul).
- (1973). *Letters to C. K. Ogden*, ed. G. von Wright (Oxford: Blackwell).
- (1974). *Letters to Russell, Keynes and Moore*, ed. G. von Wright (Oxford: Blackwell).
- (1975). *Philosophical Remarks*, trans. R. Hargreaves and R. White (Oxford: Blackwell).
- (1978). *Remarks on the Foundations of Mathematics*, 3rd edn, trans. G. Anscombe (Oxford: Blackwell).
- Woodfield, Andrew, ed. (1982). *Thought and Object* (Oxford: Oxford University Press).
- Wright, Crispin (1975). On the Coherence of Vague Predicates. *Synthese* 30, 325–65.
- (1980). *Wittgenstein on the Foundations of Mathematics* (London: Duckworth).
- (1983). *Frege's Conception of Numbers as Objects* (Aberdeen: Aberdeen University Press).
- (1984a). Kripke's Account of the Argument against Private Language. *Journal of Philosophy* 81, 759–77.

- ed. (1984b). *Frege: Tradition and Influence* (Oxford: Blackwell).
 (1986a). Inventing Logical Necessity. In Butterfield (1986), 187–209.
 (1986b). *Realism, Meaning and Truth* (Oxford: Blackwell).
 Young, Julian (1984). Wittgenstein, Kant, Schopenhauer and Critical Philosophy.
Theoria 50, 73–105.

Index of references to the Tractatus

- | | |
|------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------|
| Preface, 26 | 2.14, 6, 45 |
| 1.21, 77, 127 | 2.15, 45 |
| 2.0s, 180 | 2.15–2.1515, 44 |
| 2.01, 6 | 2.172, 4 |
| 2.012, 91 | 2.221, 1 |
| 2.0121, 128 | 3, 12 |
| 2.0124, 78, 130 | 3.02–3.0321, 26 |
| 2.0131, 146 | 3.031, 19 |
| 2.0141, 91 | 3.1–3.144, 109 |
| 2.02, 85 | 3.11, 3, 11 |
| 2.02–2.023, 44, 181 | 3.12, 1, 3 |
| 2.02–2.0272, 45 | 3.13, 1 |
| 2.0201, 85 | 3.14, 45 |
| 2.021, 77, 85, 89, 161, 181 | 3.1431, 6 |
| 2.0211, 87, 99, 100, 105, 120, 187 | 3.1432, 8 |
| 2.0212, 100, 105, 120 | 3.144, 1 |
| 2.022, 90 | 3.2 ff., 18 |
| 2.022–2.023, 77, 85 | 3.2–3.201, 66 |
| 2.023, 137, 181 | 3.2–3.21, 44, 137 |
| 2.0231, 91 | 3.2–3.221, 87 |
| 2.0231–2.0232, 87 | 3.2–3.25, 85 |
| 2.0232, 7 | 3.2–3.26, 45 |
| 2.024, 85, 181 | 3.2–3.261, 59 |
| 2.0251, 142 | 3.202–3.261, 44 |
| 2.026, 87, 90–1 | 3.203, 2, 7, 17 |
| 2.026–2.0271, 44 | 3.23, 44–5, 87, 96, 100, 105–6, 120, 177,
180, 186, 188 |
| 2.027, 183 | 3.24, 8, 64, 89, 96–7, 177, 179–80 |
| 2.027–2.0272, 77 | 3.25, 66, 143 |
| 2.0271, 85, 183 | 3.26, 66 |
| 2.0271–2.0272, 6 | 3.263, 18, 72, 126, 162, 172 |
| 2.0272, 91 | 3.3, 14, 17–19, 162 |
| 2.03, 177 | 3.31, 7 |
| 2.03–2.032, 44 | 3.31–3.314, 18 |
| 2.031, 45–6 | 3.314, 14, 17, 19 |
| 2.032, 45 | 3.315, 12 |
| 2.061, 46, 127 | 3.317, 19 |
| 2.061–2.062, 44, 77 | 3.318, 172 |
| 2.13–2.131, 44 | 3.321, 3, 7 |